

HKICPA Business Case Competition 2018

Reviewers' Comments

Comments on the Written Reports

<u>CONTENT</u>	
Strengths	Weaknesses
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Throughout and careful recommendations, implementation steps, and solutions to operational risks. ✓ Financial ratios and projections are easy to follow and logically applied. ✓ Strategies are clear, coherent, and relevant. ✓ Makes a comprehensive analysis of the company's situation. ✓ Comes up with feasible proposals, and all proposals are based on reliable analysis and data. ✓ Proposal with in-depth analysis and financial data. ✓ Problems are identified clearly. ✓ Put effort to analyze the market condition. ✓ Providing useful and clear strategies to improve operations. ✓ Deeply analyzed the market and operating background of the industry. ✓ Using SWOT to discuss business environment. ✓ Based on financial analysis, the report analyzed the profitability, liquidity, solvency and investment return detail. ✓ Provided clear strategies to improve the present difficulties faced by the companies. ✓ Suggested strategies are systematic, clear, creative, and implementable. ✓ Ethical concerns were addressed adequately. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✗ Need better numbering system. ✗ Got some unreasonable points e.g., why need to dilute the shares and cut the vote power. ✗ Insufficient numerical analysis costs to upgrade equipment / premises (Significant) not taken into account. ✗ Timelines looked very complicated and not feasible. ✗ No reasonable references. ✗ VAT deduction was not considered under the risk management. ✗ Need to produce financial projections to show expected financial consequences. ✗ Need to provide discussion on ethical standards and what to do in medium term and long term as well. ✗ Could perform more financial analysis before recommendations and actions. ✗ SWOT analysis is far from sufficient. Due to the inconsistency with relevant charts and data, the report seems stiff. ✗ No handling of the ethics portion. ✗ Financial analysis technique is quite weak, cost management strategy may not be feasible and the ethical issue analysis is incomplete. ✗ Immediate problems of Company is not highlighted and addressed specifically. ✗ Discussion on the ethical issues was too brief without technical supports/quotes from relevant professional bodies



- ✓ Financial analysis is incorporated into the proposed strategies effectively.
- ✓ With comprehensive financial data analysis and discussion of the problems identified.
- ✓ Adequate research with some innovative ideas, practical suggestions.
- ✓ SWOT analysis, market research, historical financial analysis, prospective financials were made and cohesively linked with current matters.
- ✓ Practical suggestions were given in various areas, e.g. promotion discount, app platform. Detailed references and supporting were provided.
- ✓ Voice out clearly the current financial situation by using simple ratio analysis and re-calculate the profitability.
- ✓ Ethical issue is properly and well addressed.
- ✓ Information technology (e.g. App) and diversity of products are wonderful strategies.
- ✓ Take the issue of property costs into account and initiate a combined management system.

(HKICPA).

- ✗ Executive summary is too short and not very detailed.
- ✗ Assumption of financial forecast in amenities is not clear and detailed enough; that must be supported by some researches.
- ✗ Some problems exist in the scope and application of the SWOT analysis.
- ✗ Lacking references.
- ✗ Ethics discussing isn't enough.
- ✗ No analysis or recommendation on the ethical issue.
- ✗ Not only correctly addressed the ethical issue and also proposed to review the internal control procedures, a longer sightseeing.
- ✗ Lack of research of market to support the decision and lack of feasibility of market development (no timeline, no action plan, etc.)
- ✗ Financial analysis was less extensive, the report didn't provide data sources for budget and business plans, and it lacks conclusions.
- ✗ Fails to organize the status analysis part logically, which makes the analysis cluttering.



CREATIVITY

Strengths

- ✓ Strategy is creative
- ✓ Quite bold by proposing a penetration of business into another market in Asia.
- ✓ Relatively thorough in terms of analysis of different dimensions of both Internal and external environments.
- ✓ Comprehensively analyzed the chain of the industry, Asian market and Singapore market.
- ✓ Solutions developed to handle the recent accident are sensibly designed.
- ✓ Discussed the counter measures to deal with the current accident.

Weaknesses

- ✗ Need more details on how much of the cost savings from closure of business should be used on which solutions.
- ✗ Need to make better use of financial tools in order to enhance the validity of conclusion.
- ✗ Need to provide PR solutions (i.e. immediate solutions) to the recent accident.

FORM

Strengths

- ✓ Very good presentation formats were used to illustrate concepts via graphics and tables.
- ✓ Clean and good illustration of financial position by using charts and diagrams.
- ✓ Articulate good use of language.
- ✓ The report is clear in structure, feasible in scheme and beautiful in typesetting.

Weaknesses

- ✗ The diagram is not suitable to the executive summary.
- ✗ Do not use point form in executive summary.